

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

VIACOM INTERNATIONAL INC.,)
COMEDY PARTNERS, COUNTRY)
MUSIC TELEVISION, INC.,)
PARAMOUNT PICTURES)
CORPORATION, AND BLACK)
ENTERTAINMENT TELEVISION,)
LLC,)
)
 Plaintiffs,)
)
 vs.) No. 1:07CV02103
)
YOUTUBE, INC., YOUTUBE, LLC,)
AND GOOGLE, INC.,,)
)
 Defendants.)
)

CAPTION CONTINUED ON FOLLOWING PAGE

DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL ROBINSON
FRIDAY, JANUARY 15, 2010
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA

REPORTED BY: JEANINE CURCIONE
FILE NO.: 18585

1 **CAPTION CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE**

2 THE FOOTBALL ASSOCIATION)
3 PREMIER LEAGUE LIMITED, BOURNE)
4 CO., ET AL., ON BEHALF OF) No. 07CV3582
5 THEMSELVES AND ALL OTHERS)
6 SIMILARLY SITUATED,)
7)
8)
9)
10)
11)
12)
13)
14)
15)
16)
17)
18)
19)
20)
21)
22)
23)
24)
25)

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Videotaped deposition of MICHAEL ROBINSON,
taken on behalf of Defendants, at 10:05 a.m,
Friday, January 15, 2010, at 350 South Grand Avenue,
25th Floor, Los Angeles, California, before Jeanine
Curcione, C.S.R. No. 10223, RPR, pursuant to notice.

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL:

2 FOR VIACOM PLAINTIFFS:

3 JENNER BLOCK, LLP
4 BY: SCOTT B. WILKENS, ESQ.
5 1099 NEW YORK AVENUE, NW
6 SUITE 900
7 WASHINGTON, DC 20001
8 (202) 639-6072
9 swilkens@jenner.com

10 FOR PREMIER LEAGUE PLAINTIFFS:

11 PROSKAUER ROSE, LLP
12 BY: GIL N. PELES, ESQ.
13 2049 CENTURY PARK EAST
14 SUITE 3200
15 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90067-3206
16 (310) 284-5611
17 gpeles@proskauer.com

18 FOR YOUTUBE AND GOOGLE DEFENDANTS:

19 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
20 BY: BART VOLKMER, ESQ.
21 650 PAGE MILL ROAD
22 PALO ALTO, CALIFORNIA 94304-1050
23 (650) 565-3508
24 bvolkmer@wsgr.com

25 AND

MAYER BROWN, LLP
BY: DAVID H. MCGILL, ESQ.
1675 BROADWAY
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019
(212) 506-2507
dmcgill@mayerbrown.com

FOR THE MOTION PICTURE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA AND
THE WITNESS:

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON, LLP
BY: KELLY M. KLAUS, ESQ.
355 SOUTH GRAND AVENUE
35TH FLOOR
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

1

INDEX

2

WITNESS

EXAMINATION

PAGE

3

MICHAEL ROBINSON

MR. MCGILL

5

4

5

E X H I B I T S

6

NO.

PAGE

DESCRIPTION

7

Exhibit 1 19

Organizational Chart

8

Exhibit 2 22

Subpoena

9

Exhibit 3 31

Article from Hollywood Reporter
dated 3/21/06

10

Exhibit 4 40

Letter to Bart Volkmer from Kelly
Klaus dated 8/14/08

11

12

Exhibit 5 67

Printout on Kori Bernards from
Wikipedia

13

14

Exhibit 6 76

Screen Shot from YouTube
MoviesEverywhere Channel

15

Exhibit 7 79

E-mail from Craig Winter to
Miscellaneous Recipients dated
1/5/07

16

17

Exhibit 8 89

E-mail from Brad Borchard to
Miscellaneous Recipients dated
8/2/06

18

19

Exhibit 9 89

E-mail from David Lin to Craig
Seidel dated 9/12/07

20

21

Exhibit 10 89

E-mail from Dean Garfield to
Audiblemagic dated 9/20/06

22

22

Exhibit 11 89

Letter from Audible Magic

23

Exhibit 12 89

E-mail from Craig Winter to
Miscellaneous Recipients dated
4/9/07

24

25

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

1 EXHIBITS (CONTINUED)

2 NO. PAGE DESCRIPTION

3 Exhibit 13 89 E-mail from Dean Garfield to
4 Audible Magic dated 11/15/06

5

6 QUESTIONS WITNESS INSTRUCTED NOT TO ANSWER

7 PAGE LINE

8 34 8

9 82 18

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

10:28:24 1 testify on the topics listed therein, excluding
10:28:33 2 Topics 4, 11, 12, 13 and 15?

10:28:37 3 MR. KLAUS: Objection. Vague and ambiguous.
10:28:38 4 I think it calls for a legal conclusion. Again,
10:28:40 5 there is extensive correspondence memorialized in
10:28:45 6 writing between myself and counsel for
10:28:47 7 Google/YouTube going through each of those topics.

10:28:52 8 Subject to that objection, Mr. Robinson, you
10:28:56 9 of course may answer the question.

10:28:58 10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10:29:03 11 BY MR. MCGILL:

10:29:04 12 Q. Mr. Robinson, what is the MPAA?

10:29:08 13 A. The MPAA was formed in 1922 as the trade
10:29:14 14 association for the American film industry, and
10:29:17 15 today we advocate for the motion picture industry,
10:29:23 16 television industry and for the home entertainment
10:29:28 17 industry.

10:29:29 18 Q. And "MPAA" stands for "motion picture" --

10:29:32 19 A. Motion Picture Association of America.

10:29:34 20 Q. Okay. Thank you.

10:29:34 21 And which companies are members of the
10:29:36 22 MPAA?

10:29:38 23 A. Paramount Pictures Corporation. Sony
10:29:42 24 Pictures Entertainment. 20th Century Fox Films.
10:29:45 25 Universal City Studios. Walt Disney Studios Motion

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

10:29:52 1 Picture. Warner Bros. Entertainment.

10:29:54 2 Did I name all six?

10:29:56 3 Q. Sounds like you got them all to me.

10:29:59 4 And Paramount is owned by Viacom; is that
10:30:02 5 correct?

10:30:03 6 A. Paramount is a subsidiary of Viacom, yes.

10:30:06 7 Q. So does the MPAA consider Viacom to be a
10:30:08 8 member of its association?

10:30:12 9 A. MPAA considers Paramount Pictures to be a
10:30:17 10 member of MPAA.

10:30:20 11 Q. So but my question is: Does the MPAA
10:30:23 12 consider Viacom to be a member of its association?

10:30:25 13 A. No.

10:30:30 14 Q. And am I correct that the purpose of the
10:30:32 15 MPAA is to further the goals of its members?

10:30:35 16 MR. VOLKMER: Objection. Vague and
10:30:35 17 ambiguous.

10:30:37 18 THE WITNESS: The purpose of the MPAA is to
10:30:41 19 advocate for the protection of the creative rights
10:30:48 20 and the creative works that are produced and
10:30:51 21 distributed by the industry and to aggressively
10:30:58 22 investigate and prevent copyright theft.

10:31:02 23 BY MR. MCGILL:

10:31:03 24 Q. In connection with that advocating, does
10:31:05 25 the MPAA assume a public relations role with respect

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

11:34:59 1 even within your construction of the negotiations of
11:35:02 2 Topic No. 7.

11:35:04 3 MR. KLAUS: Just for -- I do not think
11:35:04 4 that -- this should not be a big point, Mr. McGill,
11:35:08 5 but I think that the way you phrased your question
11:35:11 6 was a UGC site making content identification
11:35:16 7 technology available to content owners. And I think
11:35:20 8 the topic that we had negotiated -- and I believe if
11:35:25 9 you ask the question, then he'll be prepared to
11:35:27 10 testify to -- is UGC sites employing content
11:35:33 11 identification technology during that time frame.

11:35:36 12 BY MR. MCGILL:

11:35:36 13 Q. Okay. So let me ask you that question.
11:35:38 14 To the extent that there's a distinction there,
11:35:42 15 we'll explore it.

11:35:45 16 Mr. Robinson, are you aware of any UGC
11:35:47 17 site -- excuse me. Are you aware of any UGC video
11:35:51 18 service that made content identification -- that
11:35:54 19 employed content identification technology during
11:35:57 20 the time frame we're talking about?

11:35:59 21 A. Yeah, I believe that there were some that
11:36:01 22 did do that, specifically, Grouper and MySpace.

11:36:12 23 Q. When you say you believe that, what is
11:36:15 24 the basis for your belief?

11:36:19 25 A. Conversations that I had with

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585

11:36:26 1 Mr. Rajagopalan and information which I recall in my
11:36:38 2 capacity with the MPAA.

11:36:43 3 Q. And let's start with Grouper. What
11:36:48 4 content ID technology was Grouper, according to your
11:36:54 5 understanding, using during this time frame?

11:37:00 6 A. I believe that they were using
11:37:10 7 Audible Magic.

11:37:14 8 Q. And Audible Magic, to your understanding,
11:37:18 9 is an audio fingerprinting vendor; is that correct?

11:37:22 10 A. Yes.

11:37:22 11 Q. And at the time only offered
11:37:26 12 fingerprinting technology for audio as opposed to
11:37:29 13 video; correct?

11:37:33 14 MR. WILKENS: Objection to the form of the
11:37:34 15 question.

11:37:35 16 MR. KLAUS: It lacks foundation.

11:37:37 17 You can testify to it.

11:37:39 18 MR. MCGILL: Asking for his understanding.

11:37:40 19 MR. KLAUS: You can certainly testify to your
11:37:42 20 understanding.

11:37:45 21 THE WITNESS: Would you repeat the question.

11:37:46 22 BY MR. MCGILL:

11:37:47 23 Q. Yeah.

11:37:47 24 Do you have an understanding as to
11:37:49 25 whether Audible Magic's fingerprinting technology

DAVID FELDMAN WORLDWIDE, INC.

450 Seventh Avenue - Ste 2803, New York, NY 10123 (212) 705-8585